Edito

The first issue of the MIFS newsletter was published in January 2008, almost three years ago, as part of the research group on “Sufism and History in the Indus Valley” at the Centre for Indian and South Asian Studies (CNRS-EHESS, Paris). We thought it was an opportune time, halfway through the project on Sehwan Sharif, to propose a mid-term review of the work completed on Muslim pilgrimages in South Asia. Michel Boivin and Rémy Delage therefore organized an international conference on “Shrines, Pilgrimages and Wanderers in Muslim South Asia” on 23-24 September 2010 at the EHESS, as well as two photo exhibitions on Sehwan (Sindh) by Omar Kasmani and Ahmedabad (Gujarat) by Sara Keller (pp. 5-6).

The present issue primarily focuses on the Qalandariyya, a particular branch of Sufism. Professor Ahmet Karamustafa, a recognized expert on this tariqâ from Washington University in St. Louis, was interviewed by Delphine Ortis (pp. 2-4). Recently, a new book on Qalandars by Kumkum Srivastava was published in India. It has been reviewed here by Alexandre Papas, who himself works on the Qalandariyya movement in Central Asia (p. 9). Mojan Membrado, a specialist of Persian literature and mystical texts, at the EPHE (Paris), also offered to write on this theme, more precisely on the translation of the first ghazal of the Diwân-e Qalandar, a work attributed to La‘l Shahbâz Qalandar (pp. 7-8). Her comments on various excerpts of this ghazal shed light on this still unknown aspect of Qalandariyya poetry.

Finally, this issue concludes with a review of books and theses, as well as detailed agenda of events related to these themes. Special mention should be made of the M.A. Dissertation submitted at Karachi University by Sohail Bawani, a member of the MIFS. It raised the issue of interdisciplinarity in Social Sciences with a special focus on the Sehwan project. His work was quite useful for our group since some of his conclusions helped us to better implement our interdisciplinary approach.

Michel Boivin

In this issue

INTERVIEW WITH AHMET KARAMUSTAFA 2
CONFERENCE REPORT 5
A NOTE FROM THE DIWân-E QALANDAR 9
SPECIAL BOOK REVIEW 11
WHAT IS NEW? 12
AGENDA 15
ABOUT US 16
Ahmet Karamustafa is Professor of History and Religious Studies at Washington University in St. Louis. He has written on various aspects of the social and intellectual history of pre-modern Islam and worked especially on Qalandars and other “deviant” Sufi movements.

During his visit to Paris in May 2010, Delphine Ortis, a MIFS member, interviewed him on his intellectual trajectory as well as his vision of the Qalandariyya, and the differentiation he makes between Sufism and the cult of saints.

Could you first tell us about your educational and professional training, and how you came to work in the field of “deviant” dervish groups and Sufism? What kind of research methodology did you develop?

I did my master's thesis at the institute of Islamic Studies at McGill University in Montreal on a subject that led me eventually to the dervishes. In the study of Turkish history, the views of a particular historian, Mehmet Fuad Köprülü, had become very prevalent. He was among the first to ask the question of continuity between pre-Islamic or not yet Islamised Turks. He had peculiar views about this continuity. He saw the deviant or antinomian dervishes as survivals of shamans within an Islamic garb. In order to test this view, I worked on the hagiography of a famous 13th century Sufi master, Hacı Bektaş. After my MA thesis, I decided to work on an early 16th century text in Ottoman Turkish because I wanted to gather more information about the dervishes. My analysis led me to write a more comprehensive though short history of these dervishes from the late 12th century through the 15th century. The thesis put forward in my PhD was drastically opposed to that of Köprülü. We don't really understand these dervishes if we cast them simply as “survivals” or as superficially Islamized types; rather we should take their religiosity and their Islam seriously and attempt to come up with an explanation. I tried to find in any kind of historical sources all available references to what I called ‘dervish piety’. I sifted texts and synthesised the information I discovered in the light of what I knew about the historical context. I don't think any single explanation will hold across the board.

What do you consider to be the most striking attribute of the Qalandari path vis-à-vis other currents of piety and other deviant dervish groups?

To my mind the most important trait of the Qalandars was their persistent cultural and social ‘iconoclasticism’ and ‘unconventionalism’. They were persistent in their criticism of respectable mystics and Sufis. The temperament that prevailed was that of the happy, merry and carefree. The Qalandars had liberated themselves from social custom, which pressed down on people. They were libertine in their ways and happy and content about that. They would do anything to set themselves apart from respectable people.

Why do you use the term ‘anarchistic’, that usually belongs to the domain of politics, to characterise a movement of piety?

I use the term anarchism primarily because I wanted my readers to feel the very clear sense of criticism and of standing against established authority that I saw in dervish piety. And this critical stance is what defines them more than any other characteristic. To be ‘anarchistic’ is clearly something that really matters to Qalandars. They are actually persistently needling the authorities. That's their function. Their agenda is that of reminding people that they have to see through the ways in which power and authority works in society.
Could you determine some reasons why the Qalandari movement was essentially developed in the Persian cultural sphere?

I really don't know. But let me mention another factor. I think the Qalandari movement, like 'dervish piety' in general, is noticeably more prominent in places and times where the prevalent Islamic religious culture was that of the Hanafi-school. This legal school provides a more open space, has a more permissive attitude towards overtly antisocial or unconventional behaviour. Now, from the 13th century onwards the Persian cultural sphere is dominated by the Hanafis. So, this is one possible explanation. But there are others which have to do with the local colouring and local flavour of 'Sufisms' in the different regions.

Are you able to observe significant differences between the Qalandars of the Turkish world and those of South Asia?

Indeed, I believe there are significant differences, even probably back in the 13th century. But I don't have enough evidence concerning the early centuries of Qalandari history to give you a satisfying answer. I believe things changed drastically after the 15th century with the formation of the large scale empires. And within that context, the subsequent history of the Qalandars is one in which they quite clearly continue to react to the prevalent Sufis. But they would not deal with the same Sufis; I mean the South-Asian Qalandars were dealing with Chishtis in particular, some Suhrawardis and some Naqshbandis later on. So I would say that, yes, definitely there are differences between South Asian and Anatolian Qalandars, but they have to do with the fact that they are essentially evolving in rather different cultural domains, and with the different political circumstances of the early modern era.

In your research on dervish masters, could you discern a particular link between 'Ali or the family of the Prophet and the Qalandar, as I think is the case for La’l Shahbâz Qalandar?

Such a link is the case for all the dervishes that I am familiar with. That is not particular to La’l Shahbâz Qalandar; I would say. It is quite clear that the shaping of 'dervish piety' in general is clearly enveloped in a very special attachment to the family of the Prophet. Now, later on in Islamic history we have a tendency to associate this particular link only with the Shi’is. What we tend to forget is that especially until the 15th century, there is a lot of investment on the part of many Muslims into precisely this kind of attachment to what they consider to be the 'fountain head', the spring, the source of sanctity and sacredness in Islam. But certainly with the dervishes it is a clear move in their own minds and in the minds of their audiences to demonstrate their credentials as the true practitioners of Islam; to demonstrate that their close connection to the family of the Prophet is something that they are very clear about. This is one of the puzzles of the study of dervish piety. I still wouldn't see this as necessarily peculiar to the Qalandaris.

Two ideas you develop echo in particular with my ethnological work. Could you explain the idea of islamization, with regard to the interaction between Islam and local society?

Generally my sense is that, as historians, we really should be extremely close observers of the local scene in order to really understand the ways in which people see themselves as Muslims or are seen by others as Muslims. But as historians, we have serious limitations in doing that. We could still be much more focused on local forms of life and on local forms of piety. The problem is that there are very few historical studies along this line. A new publication of collected essays in seven volumes was just published, called 'A People's History of Christianity' (Horsley, Richard A., ed., 2005 Christian Origins. A People’s History of Christianity, Minneapolis: Fortress Press). This is a history of Christianity written not from the perspective of the church or from that of the authorities, nor of the theologians or the elites, but as we can see that history through the eyes of the people. We don't have anything like that for Islam. With my research I contributed some things to such a project, but popular piety of the local type is really what needs our attention. What I mean by that is a sort of ethnographical history, we definitely need that focus.
Secondly, you insist on the distinction between Sufism and the cult of the saints at the beginning of Islam. Could you explain this idea, with regard to the origins of the cult of the saints?

On the one hand, we have a special mode of piety, a special form of religiosity, that developed among the urban middle class, an internalised form of piety that insisted on the need to explore within ourselves. But this can’t be a popular form of religiosity.

On the other hand, we begin to see what we call the cult of saints, just like in Christianity. These are popular cults that have nothing to do with Sufism. A local warrior or learned scholar dies, is buried, and then becomes the symbol of a particular village or town. And they all become automatically saints or a member of the family of the Prophet, whatever the reasons that led to sanctity. And sanctity is not confined to Sufism. So the idea is basically that these are developing as two separate phenomena: one is Sufism, the other is the cult of saints. But both flow into one another in a spectacular way, especially from the 5th Islamic century onwards. Eventually, many of the popular saints attempted to be or simply were Sufis. Analytically these are separate developments but they become completely interlinked with one another. And Sufism benefits greatly from this linkage.

Publications


Nowadays scholarly research is influenced to a large extent by the sensationalist approaches of media reports. Far from contesting that South Asia can be considered as a hub of the most extreme forms of Islamism, we chose to focus on a largely underestimated factor: the resilience of popular forms of practicing Islam. For instance, the high attendance of pilgrimages (ziyârat) indicates that discourses and representations they produce are meaningful to local people. Therefore, popular pilgrimages play an important role in negotiating the multi levels of affiliations and belongings to a "community", be it social class, caste, tribe or sect, and to a nation still under construction, without undermining processes of political instrumentalization. For these reasons, this international symposium proposed to draw up an inventory of various forms of religious circulation in, around (especially Central Asia) and beyond South Asia (transnational religious networks). It also aimed at exploring other forms of devotional practices than those produced within Sufism and which are found, for instance, in various branches of Shi`ism and types of wandering ascetics.

Another question relates to the study of religious forms of circulation. Only a few studies have incorporated the pilgrimage as a ritual but also as a social and circulatory process, in their conceptual and methodological framework. Firstly, there is a wide range of mobile actors from wandering ascetics such as qalandar, faqîr or malang, travellers, pilgrims and vagabonds enabling the researcher to explore relationships between peregrination and pilgrimage. Then it appears relevant to draw up a typology of religious forms of circulation ranging from ritual and political processions, pilgrimages and renunciation as a form of spiritual nomadism or peregrination. Secondly, pilgrimage can be globally apprehended as a circulatory process through its itineraries and flows, as well as the volume of migrations it induces. The pilgrimage not only participates, through its inscription in historical and contemporary circulatory regimes, to the making of regional or national identities. It also participates to the diffusion of new territorial representations, while facilitating the emergence of new spaces of identification. Our objective here was to show how the articulations between place, pilgrimage and territory shape individual and collective identities and how spaces emerging out of the intense pilgrimage activity tend to reorganize the geography of Muslim pilgrimages at various scales.

Finally, the field of pilgrimage studies has recently seen new conceptual developments that reflect both the issues relating to social sciences in general, and internal issues in the field studied. It is the case of the work developed by John Eade and Michael Sallnow who consider the pilgrimage and the shrines as an arena around which multiple discourses confront themselves and out of which new forms and representations of sociality and religiosity can emerge. Thus there is a need of approaching the shrine as articulating competitive discourses over the management of saints’ power, charisma and mausoleums.

The organization of the symposium reflects the main issues that characterize the study of pilgrimages today and more generally, religious
forms of circulation within contemporary Islam. It also strives to gather approaches from different disciplines, even if the pilgrimage has often become an anthropological object. During the meeting, the discussions also determined if there were specificities to Muslim pilgrimages in these regions, when in the Middle East, the sanctuary is characterized by "the absence of both images and relics". In this two-day symposium, we intended to bring together leading experts on the field of Islam, religion and society in South and Central Asia, to revisit leading theories in social sciences regarding the study of pilgrimage in particular, but also of several forms of religious circulation.

The conference, which was an outcome of the activities of the research team “History and Sufism in the Indus Valley”, was co-organised by the Centre for South Asian Studies in Paris (CEIAS) and the CSH in New Delhi, and mainly funded by the CNRS (INSHS department), but also by the CEIAS and the CSH. With an attendance ranging from 40 to 50 persons, this gathering provided a unique opportunity to get together and exchange views and ideas on these various issues.

Thursday, 23 September 2010

9h-9h30: Welcoming of the participants

9h30-10h: Welcome address by Blandine Ripert, Director of CEIAS, EHESS-CNRS, and introduction by Michel Boivin (CNRS-CEIAS-MIFS) and Rémy Delage (CNRS-CEIAS-CSH-MIFS)

Session 1: Figures of wandering ascetics through history

During the first session, three contributors propose to analyze how the qalandari figure has been formed over time, using a large corpus of vernacular written sources mainly in Persian language, and how this movement relates to other mystical branches of South Asian Islam.

Chair: Catherine Servan Schreiber (CNRS-CEIAS)

10h-10h20: Alexandre Papas, CNRS-CETOBAC, Vagrancy and pilgrimage according to the Sufi Qalandari path

10h20-10h40: Michel Boivin, CNRS-CEIAS-MIFS, Qalandar-s and Qalandari-s: Antinomianism as a changing concept in the Indus Valley

10h40-11h: Discussion and debate

11h-11h30: Coffee break

11h30-11h50: Mojan Membrado, INALCO, Is there a connection between the Qalandars and the Ahl-e Haqq order?

11h50-12h30: Discussion and debate

Session 2: The saints’ charisma and conflicting representations of sainthood

The four papers reflect the multiple meanings of rituals that are performed in and around Sufi shrines, and which ultimately reflect the continuing success of these pilgrimages. The tension between the expression of emotions and the involvement of institutions in mediating that expression is measured in different ways.

Chair: Françoise ‘Nalini’ Delvoye (EPHE)

14h-14h20: Delphine Ortis, EHESS-MIFS, How discourses construct figures of ‘normalised holiness’

14h20-14h40: Omar Kasmani, Free University of Berlin-MIFS, Rearranging Gender: The question of spiritual authority amongst two women intercessors of Sehwan Sharif

14h40-15h: Discussion and debate

15h-15h30: Tea break

15h30-15h50: Mikko Viitamäki, University of Helsinki & Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes (EPHE, Paris), Entertaining and ecstatic. Poetics and emotions in musical gatherings of a Sufi shrine

15h50-16h10: Ute Falasch, Humboldt University (Berlin), Managing a shrine inhabited by a living saint- the dargāh of “Zinda” Shâh Madâr

16h10-16h30: Discussion and debate

18h: Cocktail and exhibition
Friday, 24 September 2010

Session 3: Pilgrimages, the city and the making of ritual spaces

The question is here about how localities, towns or cities have been structured over time by the ritual activity generated by pilgrimages but also by various actors or social groups competing for exerting social power and religious authority locally.

Chair: Thierry Zarcone (CNRS-GSRL)

9h30-9h50: Rémy Delage, CNRS-CSH-MIFS, A sociological reading of ritual processions: the case study of Sehwan Sharif in Central Sindh (Pakistan)

9h50-10h10: Yves Ubelmann, DAFA-MIFS, The shrine of La`l Shahbâz Qalandar and its urban surrounding: politics, urbanism and religion

10h10-10h30: Discussion and debate

10h30-11h: Coffee break

11h-11h20: Muhammad Mubeen, CEIAS-EHESS, The shrine and the Chishtis of Pakpattan (Pakistan): A historical analysis

11h20-12h: Jürgen Schaflechner, SAI (Heidelberg University), Moving through meaning: The pilgrimage of Hing Laj Devi in Pakistan, followed by the screening of a 17mn documentary film "Agneyatirtha Hinglaj"

12h-12h30: Discussion and debate

Session 4: Pilgrimage politics and Sufi shrines policies

Pilgrimages can be envisaged as "places" of politics in that they articulate on the one hand social and ritual activity, and on the other, competing discourses, secular and religious, tinged with different ideologies, and matrix of issues of power and domination.

Chair: Alka Patel (University of California, Irvine)

14h-14h20: Kashif Sherwani, EHESS, Maududi on Shrines and Sufism or the building of a new Islamic orthodoxy

14h20-14h40: Alix Philippon, University of Provence, An ambiguous and contentious politicization of Sufi shrines and pilgrimages in Pakistan

14h40-15h: Discussion and debate

15h-15h30: Tea break

15h30-15h50: Mauro Valdinoci, University of Modena and Reggio Emilia (Italy), Dead saints or living souls? Contested pilgrimages to Sufi shrines in Hyderabad (India)

15h50-16h10: Uzma Rehman, University of Copenhagen, Spiritual power and 'Threshold' identities: the mazars of Saiyid Pir Waris Shah and Shah Abdul Latif Bhitai

16h10-16h30: Discussion and debate

Keynote address

16h30-17h: Pnina Werbner, Keele University (UK), Transnationalism and regional cults: the dialectics of Sufism in the plurivocal Muslim world
Omar Kasmani, a PhD student in Social Anthropology at Freie Universität (Berlin), is also an artist and photographer. We are very thankful to him that he accepted to contribute while featuring a photo exhibition: “The red between black and white” (see posters).

He chose images capturing the various aspects of Sehwan Sharif in Sindh, including people (faqîrs, ascetics, women and eunuchs), events (’urs, muharram), as well as ritual practices (dhammâl, charagi, ghush) and ceremonies (nawchandi, rajabi). Around 30 photographs, mixing coloured images with black and white photos, were displayed in the main hall of the EHESS during the conference and for several weeks afterwards.

The artist's statement is:

"My work questions the 'black and white' images of the 'practising' Muslim. Devoid of nuances, it is often imagined in contrasting tropes of uncritical submission to, or outright rejection of, religious tradition. Practices at the shrine of the 'red' saint in southern Pakistan highlight an inventive vocabulary of negotiation between local devotion and translocal agency giving rise to new forms of religiosity. Far from constructions of a fixed, homogenous and universal Islam, referred to invariably in the singular, with the capital I, my encounters in Sehwan sharif reveal the dynamic, heterogenous and plural capacities of 'lived islam's".
Excerpts from a ghazal
The Diwân-e Qalandar attributed to La’l Shahbâz Qalandar, introduced by Mojan Membraco

Very little is known about the origin of the Diwân-e qalandar attributed to Sufi Saint La’l Shahbâz Qalandar who died in 1274 in Sehwan Sharif, in Sindh. The edition we used was compiled by Illahi Bakhsh and published at Sukkur in 1998. Unfortunately, the editor does not say a word on how this poetry came to him. He mentions that he was helped by scholars and mystics in translating Persian poetry into Sindhi language. He was mainly supported by the “gâdi nashîn of Sehwan of Sehwan Sharif”, Sayed Sadiq Ali Shah Sabzwari¹.

The book appears to be a collection of poems stemming from popular oral tradition. It informs us on some features of the faith that prevailed in the context where it was collected. We chose to study an excerpt in order to identify some of these features.

The first poem of Diwân-e Qalandar is comprised of 26 pages (pp. 2-28) in the tarji’band style. Tarji’band is a poetic style in which all the sections of a poem are related to each other by the same couplet which appears systematically at the end of each section. This couplet – called tarji’ (in Arabic) or bargardân (in Persian) – is:

ベンター イブラヒム クラン ドゥーム ステルク
ブンデータ メルセッシリ オン ヒルム


Heydari means “relating to Heydar”, “a follower of Heydar”, Heydar (“lion” in Arabic) is one of the nicknames of Ali. Morteza (“adequate”, “desirable”) in the second distich is another of his nicknames. Broadly speaking, Heydari refers to those who venerate Ali; but in its specific sense it is a reference to the Heydari order of dervishes². This couplet is recited in sama’ gatherings (prayer assemblies accompanied with music, song and dance).

From a literary point of view the poem presents a myriad of spelling errors and inconsistencies in the poetry rhythm. As to its structure, it contains 40 sections. Each section is composed of 4 distiches and ends with the tarji’ couplet as mentioned before. In the first section the author says that since he has felt Ali’s love he has become a Qalandar and a Heydari (kamar andar qalandari bastam / az del-e pâk Heydari hastam). In the second section Ali is recognized as a vali (a friend of God and His representative) and in the third section as a theophany, mazhar allāh – the manifestation of God in the human body.

اسد الله هم ید الله است
ولی الله مظهر الله است
حجت الله قدرت الله است
پی نظیر او ذات الله است

“Asad allāh ham yad allāh ast / Vali allāh, mazhar allāh ast / Hujjat allāh qodrat allāh ast / Bi nazir ou zât-e allāh ast”: “He is the God’s lion, God’s hand / God’s friend and representative, God’s manifestation / He is the proof of God and God’s power / There is nothing similar to him, he is God’s essence” (p. 2).

Considering Ali as the essence of God is an affirmation which transforms this poem to a highly antinomian text; as, for all Muslims God’s, essence is unique and imperceptible, nothing could be compared to it.

However, as shown in sections 4 and 5, those who scan this poem are indeed Muslims: in section 4 there are multiple references to the verses of the Koran and in section 5 a reference to the prophet of Islam who according to the author, approves of what is said in this poem about the status of Ali.

Section 6 refers to Nosey (or Nosayr), a figure well-known to all “extremist” Shi’i orders. As we know, Nosey is the name of a Shi’i order which is established in Syria, Lebanon and Turkey, also known as Alawis. But the reference made to Nosey and his followers (Noseyri) is not necessarily understood in relation to this order. According to a myth widespread in certain Shi’i communities, Nosey was a slave of Ali and recognized the latter as God. As, according to Islamic belief, regarding a human being as God is heresy, Ali killed him. Then he remembered the


² This is more than a supposition, as we will see further (section 30, p. 20), the author affirms bearing a “Heydari axe” (tabar-e Heydari). Axe is an element of dervishes panoply. On Heydari order, see among others Mehmed Fuad Köprülü, Abdûlbaki Gölpinarlı and Ahmet Yashar Ocak.
promise he had made to Noseyr’s old mother who had asked him to protect his son and bring him back to her alive, so Ali restored Noseyr back to life. Once Noseyr was raised from his death, he told Ali: “If I had any doubt about your divinity, now that you brought me back to life I am more than sure that you are God”. Ali killed him again and this scenario repeated seven times. Then God ordered Ali to let Noseyr be: “I am the creator of the universe and I am God for all the creation, but I give permission to Noseyr and his followers to recognize you as God”.

In this poem we read “man Ali dânam, Ali gooyam / chon Noseyri keh bande-h-ye ouyam”: “I know Ali, I call Ali / like a Noseyri I am Ali’s slave” (p.6). Moreover in section 34 the name Noseyri is given to the faith in the poem. “Chon Noseyri keh nam dâram man / Ali vali allâh âshkâram man”: “As my name is Noseyri / the fact that Ali is a valî of God is obvious to me (or: As a Noseyri that I am / I claim obviously that Ali is the valî of God)” (p. 24).

Sections 7 and 8 are dedicated to Ali. In section 9 we read “Sarvar-e harkeh Mortezâ bâshad / Peyrov-e din-e Mostafâ bâshad”: “whoever takes Ali for his lord / is a follower of the religion of the Prophet” (p. 6); and in the section 12 it is said that whoever is not a follower of Heydar (Heydari) is a non-believer, “Gheyr-e Heydari ham agar dâni / kâfari o yahûdi o nasrâni” (if you believe in anything else but Heydar / You are a non-believer, a Jew, a Christian) (p. 8). We see here that in the author’s view any belief other than in Ali is considered useless.

Pages 10 to 20 (sections 13-28) are a praise to the ‘Fourteen Immaculate’ -Mohammad, Ali, Fâtemeh and their descendants the Shi‘i imams. This part testifies the Duodeciman Shi‘i feature of the author’s faith. In section 21, relating to Imam Kâzem, the seventh imam for duodeciman Shi‘ies, there is a sudden aggressiveness. The author insults the enemies of this imam. It might be intended for the Shi‘ites who do not recognize Kâzem as the seventh imam, e.g. the ismailians. “Doshman-eoust kâfar-e motiqaq / beshno khârej sag o ahiqaz”: “His [Kâzem’s] enemy is an absolute non-believer / Listen you outsider!” (p. 14).

Some military features and a warrior spirit are observed in sections 30, 31 (pp. 20-21). “[...] Tabar-e Heydarist dar datam / Qâtel-e an jamî’ man hastam [...]”: “I am bearing a Heydari axe / I am the killer of them all [all the enemies]”. The aggressiveness toward enemies mentioned in section 21 recurs in section 33, where the outsiders are addressed as dogs, idiots and imbeciles. Section 35 (p. 24) curses ibn Moljam (The assassin of Ali), ibn Ziyâd (the Governor of Kufa and one of the leaders of the army of Yazid during the battle of Karbala where Hosayn the third imam was martyred), ibn Khattâb (‘Omar, the second Caliph), Shemr (The assassin of Hoseyn).

Some parts of the poem are expressed enigmatically, using numbers instead of names. For example, in section 36 we read: “Yek sad o si o ye k monâfeq dân / Si sad o dah ou movâfeq dân / shesh sad o shast o ye k motâfeq dân / Yek sad o bist o haft fâseq dân”: “Consider the 131 as a hypocrite / Recognize 310 as an ally / 631 is adopted / 127 should be considered sinful” (p. 24). These numbers might be the names converted by the abjad’ system.

The identity of the author is acknowledged in the sections 38 and 40. “[...] manam Shahbâz bande-h-ye dargâhash [...]”: “I am Shahbâz the slave of his threshold” (section 38, p. 26); “[...] manam Othmân Marvandi bande-h-ye dargâhash [...]”: “I am Othmân Marvandi, the slave of his threshold” (section 40, p. 28). However, comparing the literary quality of this text to some other poems attributed to Othman Marvandi, one can conclude whether this text is his or not, and whether it has been distorted by oral transmission.

The study of this kind of dervish popular literature is nevertheless interesting because it informs us about a form of dervish piety and perhaps also be the manner in which Marvandi’s ideas were understood among popular layers of society.

¹ The Abjad numerals are a decimal numeral system in which the 28 letters of the Arabic alphabet are assigned numerical values. The Abjad numbers are used to assign numerical values to Arabic words for purposes of numerology. For example the word “Allâh” ﷺ has a numeric value of 66 (1+30+30+5).

² Sheykht Othmân Marvandi (d. 1274) known as “La’ Shahbâz Qalandar” is a Muslim mystic of the Indian subcontinent. His other nicknames are “Seyf al-lesân”, “Shams al-dîn”, “Makhdoom”, “Mahdi” and more but he generally used “Othmân” or “Shahbâz” as his pen name. According to some sources he was a Qâderi dervish. Other sources designate him as the founder of the Qalandari Shahbâz order (See for example: ‘Affân Saljouq, Bâ lâm Shahbâz beraqsim, Heydâriâbâd: Khâneh-ye Farhang-e Iran).

Despite its flashy comics-style cover design, this book is a scholarly piece. Composed of six chapters and two appendices, Srivastava’s monograph deals with Qalandars in general and Delhi region’s Qalandari shrines in particular.

The first chapter (“Sufism: Concept, Nature and Origin”) presents an overview on the *tasawwuf* based on classical works by Gardet, Anawati, Nicholson, Schimmel, etc. Given the already existing literature on this topic, the section does not seem very useful and could have been replaced by one focusing on Indian Sufism. The second chapter (“Sufi orders”) presents again, apparently, a general introduction to *turûq*. In fact, Srivastava’s description is deeply influenced by the Indian context: for instance, the classification of orders in *bashara* (ba shar’) and *beshara* (bî shar’) sects, or the concept of *piri-muridi* are typically Indian and not necessarily relevant to other Islamic areas. Yet, the author rightly insists on the importance of *silsila*, *khanqâh*, and the worship of saints as key features. The third chapter (“Antinomian cults with specific reference to the Qalandars and the Qalandariya path”) is well-documented and provides the reader with various names and practices of Qalandari groups and leaders, especially but not exclusively in medieval India. The relations of the Qalandars with other religious orders are also mentioned.

The second part of the book is definitely more original as it focuses on two Qalandari *dargahs*, located in Delhi region, which have not been studied in detail. Chapter 4 (“The shrine of Hazrat Sheikh Abu Bakr Tusi Haydari Qalandari, the Matkey Shah of Purana Qila, Mathura Road, Delhi”) details not only the architecture, organization, and history of the sacred site, but also the biography of the thirteenth-century Iranian saint Abu Bakr Tusi. Chapter 5 (“The shrine of Hazrat Sharfuddin Bu Ali Shah Qalandar of Panipat (Haryana), one of the two-and-a-half Qalandars”) describes the mausoleum of the famous medieval saint Bu Ali Shah. A large part of the section is devoted to the life and sayings of the great Qalandari poet. The reader will find numerous anecdotes and quotations. Worth noting also are the illustrations in these two chapters. On the basis of the two case studies, the book’s last section discusses at length the “Organization and practices of the shrines”. Among the main features that both *dargahs* share is important to emphasize: 1) the different roles of the *khuddâm*; 2) the *qawwâlî* performances; 3) the variety of rituals.

At the end of her book, Kumkum Srivastava offers two valuable appendices: the Urdu text and English translation of Qalandari poetry and prose, and of *qawwâlî* songs. To sum up, this monograph represents a valiant effort at providing an introduction to the Qalandariyya Sufi path. This is not so frequent in India’s Islamic studies.

Alexandre Papas (CNRS, Paris)

Other recent publications on Sufism in South Asia


Thierry V. Zarcone, *Sufi Pilgrims from Central Asia and India in Jerusalem*, Kyoto, Kyoto University, Kyoto, Kyoto University, 2009.


Sayyid Ahmed Barelwi is a well known figure of Islamic revival in South Asia, usually associated with the last phase of the expansion of British colonization at the beginning of the 19th century. His career is both a religious one, as well as a military one. He headed the last resistance against the Western expansion of the British Empire in India. But his fame is due to the different roles he played among his Muslim followers. Finally, the two careers merged through his death as a martyr on the battlefield at Balakot in 1831. During his lifetime, he, himself proclaimed to be the khalifa of Khorasan but after his death, some of his disciples venerated him as the Mahdi, the Muslim saviour who will come for the Day of Judgement. Mainly based on colonial sources, the book does not attempt to explain why Sayyid Ahmed Barelwi was a “misunderstood Mahdi”. Nonetheless, a step forward was achieved since in a previous publication, Gaborieau called him the “forgotten Mahdi”.


As a historian of Medieval India, Samira Sheikh publishes a slightly revised version of the Ph. D. she prepared at Oxford University some years ago. The book is most useful since it provides both a broad synthesis of the formative period of Gujarati identity, as well as a very comprehensive analysis of the interaction between the different strata which gave birth to the pre-modern state, namely the Sultanate. Moreover, the issues addressed by Sheikh obviously concern a large part of North India. For example, she gives valuable arguments regarding the processes of formation of groups like the Rajputs. Last but not the least, Sheikh is well aware of the most recent trends in the history of India, in other words the post-colonial studies, and she is thus able to provide a balanced understanding on how pre-modern Gujarat provided the essential features on which modern Gujarat was to be built.


A dense issue of a journal specialized in “geopolitics”, *Outre Terre*, is devoted to Afghanistan and Pakistan, a theme reminiscent of the concept of “Af-Pak” coined by the US army. The editor nonetheless asserts in the first paper on the Durand line that it would be more relevant to use “Pakaf” (p. 9). The reader should, however, not stop at the enigmatic equation which works as a title. The volume gives a valuable insight into the different provinces of Pakistan, and the different features – cultural and others – of each of them. With numerous coloured maps, esxcellent articles are side by side with other more superficial papers. But although the papers based on factual analysis are numerous, there are also salient studies by confirmed scholars like Mariam Abou Zahab or Ahmed Rashid. The balance between such studies and factual reports is nonetheless not always convincing.
**Integrating Interdisciplinarity in research and teaching/learning at higher educational level in Pakistan: exploring the case of Sehwan Interdisciplinary Project (SIP), MA thesis, 122 p.**

This qualitative case study seeks to explore ways of integrating interdisciplinarity at the higher educational level in Pakistan, with special reference to illustrate viable moves for policy and practices in the area of research and teaching/learning. With this aim, this research provides an in-depth analysis of the Sehwan Interdisciplinary Project (SIP) as a case in action of integrating interdisciplinarity to draw key empirical insights for theory and practice in Pakistani academia. The research focuses on examining the meaning, nature, processes and challenges of integrating interdisciplinarity in the Sehwan Interdisciplinary Project (SIP) through its team members.

The research finds that interdisciplinarity is an evolving process than a fixed construct: from its multi/pluridisciplinary phase to its full-grown interdisciplinary stage. The nature of interdisciplinarity within the SIP is a sort of disciplinary enrichment. In this case, each discipline explores and extracts from plurality of disciplinary sources to address the research problematic. In this regard, SIP had gone through a number of processes, procedures and related challenges to integrate such dynamics at the level of meaning and nature into the Project.

Lastly, while analyzing the following recommendations from SIP team members, the research provides useful insights for integrating interdisciplinarity at the higher educational level in Pakistan: (a) rethinking the conception of knowledge in the Pakistani academia; (b) seeking national interdisciplinary research initiatives, knowledge production and dissemination practices; (c) harnessing interdisciplinary research in social sciences by seeking cross cultural/institutional collaborations; (d) developing intra-disciplinary/departmental synergies through creating new objects of inquiries; and (e) institutionalizing interdisciplinarity at macro and micro levels in higher education.

---

**The Issue of Hur: Representation in the Historiography of Sindh, MA thesis, 73 p.**

This thesis aimed at understanding how certain narratives about the Hurs of Sindh generated by British colonial administers have become dominant tropes of the Hur identity and representation. However, the present study sought to question established assumptions and argue that the British construction of Hur identity has also been accepted uncritically by Sindhi historians, writers, nationalist as well as scholars trained in western academic discourses. Two novel are presented here – one by H. T Lambrick *The Terrorist* (1972) and another by Muhammad Usman Deplai, *Sanghar* (1963) – in order to show how both authors have articulated the Hur identity in a particular way and how these writings became later standard texts to write fictional and non-fictional narratives of the Hurs. The thesis also argues that some trends that have emerged recently to salvage the Hur history and re-write it from a Sindhi nationalist perspective, should also be subjected to critical questioning. Different genres of writing are discussed here to show that within Sindh different scholars and literary traditions exist, that are embedded in modernism, nationalism, and the Marxist tradition, and take different positions on modernity, development and social change. The thesis is concluded with the argument that the issue of Hur representation needs to be studied within the broader perspective of representation and history of Sindh, by bringing in oral narratives, public memory, Subaltern Hur voice and by critically examining dominant and alternative Hur narratives.

---

**Authors**

**Integrating Interdisciplinarity in research and teaching/learning at higher educational level in Pakistan: exploring the case of Sehwan Interdisciplinary Project (SIP), MA thesis, 122 p.**

Sohail Bawani  
(University of Karachi, Pakistan)

**Discipline**  
Sociology

**Supervisor**  
Prof. Fateh Muhammad Burfat

**Date**  
20 July 2010

**Jury**  
Dr. Rana S. Sultan  
Dr. Nabil Zuberi

**Keywords**  
knowledge process  
interdisciplinarity  
multi/pluridisciplinary integration  
procedures  
challenges  
social sciences  
teaching/learning  
research  
higher education  
policy and practice

**The Issue of Hur: Representation in the Historiography of Sindh, MA thesis, 73 p.**

Chang, Abdul Haque  
(University of Texas, Austin, USA)

**Discipline**  
Cultural Anthropology

**Supervisor**  
Prof. Dr. Kamran Asdar Ali

**Date**  
2010

**Jury**  
Kushik Gosh

**Keywords**  
representation  
historiography  
Sindh

Murugan is one of the gods of the Hindu pantheon, whose religious figure has been present in the South of India for at least two thousand years. Its worship is strongly associated with the cultural identity of Tamil Nadu (the « Tamil country » in the South of India), the cardinal points of which are marked by the presence of its six largest pilgrimage centres. This symbolic and geographic interaction between the temples of Murugan, the territory and the religious circulations dates back at least to the Middle Ages. It is to be found today at the local level too, either of a village or an urban area; it is to be found at the international scale of the diaspora as well, which is reinventing the geography of worship by giving it a transnational configuration. For all cases under study, the survey shows that in relation to the other gods of the Hindu pantheon, the definition of this Hindu deity has endowed it with particular symbolic characteristics, which trigger and direct human actions that are printed in the geographic space, such as the construction of temples or the devotional pilgrimages towards its sacred places. Thus the situation of its temple on the hill that overlooks the Mailam village (Tamil Nadu) depends as much on Murugan’s thousand-year-old association with peaks as on its position in relation to the places of worship of other deities. This happens to be the case in a local geography where deities, social groups and the relating spaces are both classified and classifying. In Mauritius, the famous processions for Murugan and the over-representation of its temples suggest a context of assertion of the Tamil community against the Hindu majority originating from the North. It also confirms the degree of significance of the places and circulations associated to this worship, to the point of producing territorial acts.

Author  
Pierre-Yves Trouillet  
(University of Bordeaux III, France)

Discipline  
Geography

Supervisor  
Prof. Singaravelou

Date  
13 December 2010

Jury  
- Rémy Delage  
- Guy Di Méo  
- Odette Louiset  
- Catherine Servan-Schreiber  
- Singaravelou

Keywords  
India, Tamil Nadu, Mauritius, Hinduism, temple, place, circulation, territory, scale, pantheon, caste, ethnicity, diaspora, Murugan


Indological and Anthropological studies have for long ignored the shrine of Hiṅglāj Devi, or Nānī Mā as she is also called, in Baluchistan. This Magister-thesis explores the narratives of this particular religious place and argues that its remote position and ancient history have, over the years, led to multiple and often overlapping mytho-historical oral traditions and writings. Such myths, often reflecting the socio-political changes of the area, are found among various religious communities and thus thwart a conventional segregation of religious taxonomies at the shrine. Due to such overlapping discourses the heuristic value of the concept of “Syncretism” is discussed and scrutinized for its usage within this case study.

The second part of the book focuses on the history and the symbolic interpretation of the shrine among one particular group, the Brahmakṣatriya/Khatri caste of West Rajasthan. One of their main texts, the “Brahmakṣatriyotpatti Evam Marī Ḍīṛgulāj” is given in translation from Hindi, to show how the goddess as a religious symbol, along with the power of a sanskritic-brahmanic discourse, are used to justify the caste’s claim to be of Kṣatriya origin.

Author  
Jürgen Schaflechner  
(University of Heidelberg, Germany)

Discipline  
Modern South Asian Languages and Literature

Supervisor  
Prof. Hans Harder  
Dr. Jörg Gengnagel

Date  
7 July 2009

Keywords  
Hinglaj Devi, Avar, Karni Mata, Carani Sagati, Lhatri Community, Brahmanasatiya, Parashurama, Mythology, Caran Community, Cultural Memory

Mission Interdisciplinaire Française du Sindh – Newsletter 5 – November 2010
5-7 November 2010
Chiang Mai, Thailand
Conference
Asian Borderlands: Enclosure, Interaction and Transformation
2nd Conference of the Asian Borderlands Research Network
RCSD, Chiang Mai University
Convenors:
Dr. Chayan Vaddhanaphuti, Chiang Mai University
Dr. Erik de Maaker, Leiden University
Dr. Mandy Sadan, School of Oriental and African Studies
Prof. Willem van Schendel, University of Amsterdam

24 November 2010
Istanbul, Turkey
Workshop
The Social Production of Culture in Nineteenth Century South Asia: British Colonization, Popular Culture and the New Elites in Sindh
Islam Arastirmalari Merkezi (ISAM)

27 November 2010
Karachi, Pakistan
Conference
Third International Conference on the Cultural and Historical Legacy of Pakistan
Cultural Diversity and Processes of Patrimonialization
Organized by MIFS and AFK

1-4 December 2010
Nicosia, North Cyprus
International Conference
Islamic Civilization in the Mediterranean
IRCICA and the Institute for Islamic Research and Intercultural Dialogue, Near East University (Nicosia/Lefkoşe)

6 December 2010
Saint Andrews, Scotland
Workshop
Saints and Holy Figures Portraits and Their Sacred Function in Saint Veneration
Department of Social Anthropology, University of St-Andrews
Convenors:
Pedram Khosronejad, University of St-Andrews, Scotland
Thierry Zarcone, CNRS-GSRL, Paris

7-9 December 2010
New Delhi, India
Conference
The Politics of Ethnicity on the Margins of the State: Janjatis/Adivasis in India and Nepal
India International Centre, Delhi
With the support of CSH (New Delhi), ICSSR (New Delhi), CNRS (Paris), MSH (Paris)
Convenors:
Marine Carrin, CNRS, Toulouse
Gérard Toffin, CNRS, Paris

20-22 December 2010
Bangalore, India
Conference
Asian Culture Industries: A Comparative Study of India, Japan and South Korea
Centre for the Study of Culture and Society, Bangalore
Japan Foundation

2-4 February 2011
New Delhi, India
Conference
Christianity in History: Encounters, Engagements and Experiences in India and South Asia
Institute for Religion and Society in Asia (IRSA), Oxford, UK
Centre for Historical Studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University (JNU), New Delhi

31 March-3 April 2011
Honolulu, Hawaii
Conference
ICAS Conference
Association for Asian Studies (AAS)
International Convention of Asia Scholars (ICAS)
www.asian-studies.org

30 June-3 July 2011
Thimphu, Bhutan
Conference
Mountains in the Religions of South and Southeast Asia: Place, Culture, and Power
4th Conference of the SSEASR
South & Southeast Asian Association for the Study of Culture and Religion
http://www.sseasr.org
Editors of the Newsletter
Michel Boivin (mboivin@ehess.fr) and Rémy Delage (delage.remy@gmail.com)

Contributors
Sohail Bawani, Michel Boivin, Abdul Haque Chang, Rémy Delage, Ahmed Karamustafa, Omar Kasmani, Mojan Membrado, Delphine Ortis, Alexandre Papas, Jürgen Schaflechner, Pierre-Yves Trouillet

Compilation and layout
Rémy Delage

Translation
Michel Boivin and Rémy Delage
(with the help of Arpita Mitra)

Photos
© MIFS

Centre d'Etudes de l'Inde et de l'Asie du Sud (CEIAS), Paris
http://ceias.ehess.fr/

Fondation Maison des Sciences de l'Homme (FMSH), Paris
http://www.msh-paris.fr/

Fondation Max Van Berchem, Geneva
http://www.maxvanberchem.org/